Privacy calculus model in e-commerce – a study of Italy and the United States

Tamara Dinev¹, Massimo Bellotto², Paul Hart³, Vincenzo Russo⁴, Ilaria Serra³ and Christian Colautti⁴

¹Department of Information Technology and Operations Management, College of Business, Florida Atlantic University, Boca Raton, FL, U.S.A.; ²University of Verona, Verona, Italy; ³Florida Atlantic University, Boca Raton, FL, U.S.A.; ⁴University IULM, Milano, Italy.

Correspondence:

Tamara Dinev, Department of Information Technology and Operations Management, College of Business, Florida Atlantic University, 777 Glades Rd, Boca Raton, FL 33431, U.S.A. Tel: +1 954 762 5313; Fax: +1 954 762 5245; E-mail: tdinev@fau.edu

Received: 22 December 2004 Revised: 29 August 2005 2nd Revision: 14 November 2005 Accepted: 21 November 2005

Abstract

This study examines cross-cultural differences beliefs related to e-commerce use for Italy and the United States. We argue that for both cultures, the user's decision to make an online purchase is simultaneously influenced by a set of contrary factors. These include decision facilitators such as propensity to trust and institutional trust, and decision inhibitors such as perceived risk and privacy concerns. We argue that substantial cultural differences exist that affect the above factors and the relationships among them. We use Hofstede's cultural theory and Fukuyama's theory of trust and social capital, along with emic factors important for the Italian society, to develop the study's propositions. The hypotheses were empirically tested using LISREL structural equation modeling and multigroup analysis. The results revealed that the Italian society exhibited lower propensity to trust, institutional trust, privacy concerns, and higher perceived risk. The relationships between institutional trust and ecommerce use, privacy concerns and e-commerce use, and perceived risk and institutional trust are all weaker for Italy. The relationship between perceived risk and privacy concerns is stronger for Italy. The paper's major contribution is in validating an important model of e-commerce use across two cultures and showing the moderating effects of culture.

European Journal of Information Systems (2006) **15**, 389–402. doi:10.1057/palgrave.ejis.3000590

Keywords: cross-cultural research; Internet use; Internet privacy; Internet trust; LISREL; multigroup analysis

Introduction

Privacy and the cross-country differences in privacy regulations are among the 10 most important trends that will impact the Internet in the first decade of the 21st century (Erbschloe, 2001). Building competitive advantage through providing relevant product information to customers, personalized services, customized incentives and products can only be realized when consumers provide personal information. The need to gather more personal data, however, increases the threat to customers' privacy and may affect the further growth of Internet usage because of growing privacy concerns. Furthermore, the global nature of the Internet and e-commerce is making privacy issues even more complex because the perceptions of privacy, trust, risk, and fair information practices vary across cultures and depend on government regulations (Milberg et al., 2000; Bellman et al., 2004). Designing the appropriate practices for information collection and addressing cultural variation in trust and privacy perceptions should allow global corporate marketers to more readily facilitate the free exchange of Internet services across countries.

MIS researchers (Milberg *et al.*, 2000; Bellman *et al.*, 2004) have found that there are differences in information privacy concerns across cultures.

However, few studies are available that examine how these privacy concerns affect the extent of Internet and ecommerce use and how the simultaneous influence of negative and positive factors affect the decision-making process of an international Internet user. Following Culnan & Bies' (2003) risk-benefit privacy calculus concept, Dinev & Hart (2003, 2006) conducted a study of contrary factors that simultaneously influence the ecommerce use. They showed that the most salient factors that influence Internet users' decisions are privacy concerns, perceived risk, and trust. We think that these vary among Italian and U.S. cultures and have chosen to study them in this context. The technological and regulatory conditions between the two countries are comparable although there are a number of socioeconomic conditions precluding Internet adoption and e-commerce use in Italy as compared to the United States or Northern European countries. However, there are also substantial cultural differences which could account for the difference in the decisions to submit personal information or to use the Internet as a whole. These are the specific focus of the study. Our objective is to study cross-national differences of privacy, trust, and perceived risk and examine how they affect e-commerce use and the willingness to provide personal information.

Two different but complimentary cultural study approaches (Berry, 1980), etic and emic, were used in the theoretical development of the study. The etic approach focuses on the differences across cultures of a universal conceptual model. The emic approach is a qualitative examination of culture-specific values and focuses on constructs from within a specific culture seeking to understand the perspective of the people from within that culture (Church & Katigbak, 1988). Cross-cultural research requires both perspectives (Berry, 1980; Malho-tra *et al.*, 1996).

Internet and e-commerce diffusion in Italy

Italy has the fourth largest economy in Europe and the seventh largest in the world. Since the vast majority of Italy's economic development has occurred since the end of the World War II, its status as one of the world's largest economic powers is relatively recent. In the years since the end of World War II, Italy's economy has changed from primarily agrarian to post-industrial. This rapid economic development, unique among Western nations, has had a decidedly strong impact on Italian culture and society.

As measured by internet access, Italy is reported to be the third largest country in Europe, after Germany and U.K., by total people online (Nielsen, 2004). The high number of reported Internet users reflects a high number of Italian Internet Service Providers (among the highest in Europe) and does not translate automatically to individual Internet use *per se*. In fact, 66.1% of the respondents from the Internet Report Project (Mandella & Bossi, 2002) were not Internet users. Although the percentage of Italian companies conducting business online ranks in the middle among Western European countries, the number of businesses actually doing ecommerce is negligible. In fact, with respect to the latter, Italy is at the bottom of the rankings along with Spain, Portugal and Greece (Nielsen, 2004). Of the 8.5 million Italians who used the Internet in 2002, only 14.5% bought goods or services online, 8.3% less than in 2001, (Mandella & Bossi, 2002); and only 3.5% of Italian bank clients used online banking services, as opposed to 12% of German bank clients and 25% of Swedish bank clients who used online banking services. In conclusion, Italians use the Internet primarily to get information and develop social relationships, not to buy and sell, with most of the online sales coming from the B2B sector.

There are a number of socio-economic reasons impeding Internet adoption and e-commerce use in Italy as compared to the United States or Northern European countries (Barba, 2000; Barba & Ferro, 2000): (1) unfamiliarity with English, the primary language on the Web; (2) The Italian commerce structure, consisting of numerous small specialized family-run shops that lack the resources and incentives for rapid online migration and are poorly suited for e-commerce; (3) The relatively small rate of PC penetration at homes; (4) The high number of mobile phone users in Italy, the world's fourth-largest mobile telecommunications market, which has kept fixed-line telephone prices high, consequently, PC-based internet use expensive; (5) Lack of competitive pricing of online products and services as compared to the more traditional venues; (6) Low credit card usage; (7) A general fear of web-based interactions, including privacy concerns and credit card fraud vulnerabilities (Mandella & Bossi, 2002); (8) The historic diffidence of Italians towards commerce that is not face-to-face (historically success of mail order catalogue ventures have also been poor and the Italian public is still uncertain when it comes to stores that exist only virtually) (Mandella & Bossi, 2002). In addition, Italy, along with Spain, has the largest digital gender gap (UCLA, 2004) among European countries, with 42% of Italian men online compared with 22% of women.

While the economic factor differences are beyond the scope of this study, the psychological factors reflected in (7 and 8) above are of our prime interest. Our study uses the etic-based theoretical comparison of the cross-cultural variances in the constructs and hypothesized relationships. Culture-specific emic phenomena are then taken into account to form the research hypotheses.

Hofstede and Fukuyama cultural theories

In order to quantitatively measure a culture, a multidimensional approach has been successfully applied by cross-cultural psychologists and cultural anthropologists (Bourdieu, 1984, 1989; Triandis, 1995; Rhee *et al.*, 1996). Hill *et al.* (1998), Straub *et al.* (2001), and Choudrie & Lee (2004) conceptualized cultural influence modeling by arguing that culture-specific beliefs and social norms, technological culturation, and national policy/infrastructure affect systems usage.

Probably the best-known and most influential multidimensional approach is the cultural index developed by Hofstede (1980, 2003) whose framework clustered cultures based on five distinctly different dimensions: (1) Power Distance Index (PDI) refers to the extent of adherence to formal authority (i.e. how much a society accepts unequal distribution of power in institutions and organizations). Members of high PDI cultures are more comfortable with centralized powers than members of low PDI cultures. (2) Individualism-Collectivism (IND) focuses on the basic level of behavior regulation of an individual's relationships with respect to others. In a collectivist society, individuals regard group interest as more important than individual interest. Thus, collectivists might display great loyalty to their group. They prefer a cohesive and tightly knit social fabric and rarely move in and out of groups. A society high on individualism implies a loosely knit society in which people consider themselves independent of others, pursue personal goals, move in and out of groups easily. (3) Uncertainty Avoidance Index (UAI) measures the importance of rules and standards and how much people feel threatened by high levels of uncertainty and ambiguity in the environment. Individuals from high uncertainty avoidance societies attempt to reduce personal risk, while being more likely to resist innovative ideas and conform to rules. (4) Masculinity-Femininity (MAS). (5) Long-Term Time Orientation (LTO) - strategic and financial caution is highly prized by members of a high LTO society. They place great significance on thrift, persistence, and long-term alliances. Although there were substantial critics of the Hofstede theory (Myers & Tan, 2002; Ford et al., 2003) and its relevance to IT research almost 30 years after its development, his cultural classification is still the most widely used (e.g. Straub et al., 1997; Pavlou & Chai, 2002).

For this study, Hodstede's IND and UIA were used to explain the differences in privacy concerns, perceived risk and trust between the two societies under consideration. Another influential theory employed in this study is Fukuyama's theory of trust and social capital (Fukuyama, 1995). Fukuyama combines economic and cultural arguments to present a theory of trust, in which he correlates a country's economic prosperity with the amount of social capital within that country. The concept of social capital refers to the features of social organization, including trust and trustworthiness that improve efficiency by facilitating cooperative actions. The culture of trust as a source of spontaneous sociability allows enterprises to grow beyond family into professionally managed organizations. Fukuyama identified groups of 'high-trust' countries (e.g. U.S., Germany, and Japan) and 'low-trust' countries (e.g. Italy, France, Korea, and Taiwan). From this perspective, the U.S. and Italy are at opposite poles of Fukuyama's spectrum of trust.

Table 1 Hofstede cultural indices for Italy and the United States

| Country | Power distance | Individual- ism/Collecti- vism | Uncertainty avoidance | Masculi- nity | Long-term orientation |
|------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------------------------|
| Italy | 50 | 76 | 75 | 70 | 69 |
| United States | 40 | 91 | 46 | 62 | 29 |

The Hofstede (1980, 2003) and Fukuyama (1995) theoretical frameworks provide a solid basis for observing cultural distances between Anglo-American and Mediterranean cultures. Table 1 lists Hofstede's scores for Italian and U.S. cultures. The cumulative cultural characteristics indicate that individuals in the U.S. tend to be informal, individualistic, achievement oriented. They value punctuality, voluntary associations, progress, innovation, and youth. Other empirical studies confirmed the U.S. as being first among individualistic societies (Triandis, 1995; Rhee et al., 1996). Paradoxically, Fukuyama's theory posits that the high U.S. individualism promotes a propensity to form communities and an inclination to join voluntary associations. Individuals in the U.S. historically possess strong and important communal structures that give the society resilience and dynamism and a sense of collectivism that translates into an ability to create large economical organizations more spontaneously (Fukuyama, 1995). Weber (1946) noted that U.S. democracy is not a 'sand heap' of individuals but a 'buzzing complex' of voluntary associations.

Italians score higher than U.S. Americans on all indices - PDI and collectivism (i.e. lower IND), UAI, MAS, and LTO. This implies that Italians are relatively more accepting of unequal power distributions and more concerned with in-group interest rather than self-interest. Italians tend to be relatively more formal, collectivistic, cooperative, and stability-oriented. Reflecting a low-trust society, Italian families play a central role, voluntary associations are relatively weak, and this translates into a lower ability to build large economic organizations (Fukuyama, 1995). In order to derive the difference in perceptions of privacy, risk, and trust and how they affect e-commerce use, we will consider the emic-etic complimentary approach in explaining certain characteristics that are important but not captured by Hofstede's five indices. Interestingly, these characteristics introduce paradoxical and counterintuitive privacy beliefs with respect to e-commerce.

Research hypotheses

The study adapted the model of privacy calculus developed by Dinev & Hart (2003, 2006). Their model (Figure 1) empirically explores the simultaneous effect of personal beliefs, including privacy risks, all associated with inhibiting or facilitating the intention to conduct



Figure 1 Privacy calculus model, adapted after Dinev & Hart (2006) with enhanced measurement of trust.

e-commerce transactions. As shown in their study, a user's decision to become involved in an e-commerce transaction is influenced simultaneously by two sets of contrary factors. The set of inhibitors are Internet privacy concerns and perceived risk. They were shown to hinder decisions to get involved in e-commerce transactions. The set of drivers are trust, personal interest, and perceived control over personal information submitted. These factors were shown to positively influence a purchase decision. The important concept in this model is the cumulative influence of the inhibitors and drivers, forming the so-called 'privacy calculus' (after Culnan & Armstrong, 1999) where each set can outweigh the other, determining the user's final decision on whether to transact online. If the cumulative effect of trust and control (Dinev & Hart, 2003) is higher than the cumulative effect of privacy concerns and perceived risk, the user will more likely make a decision to purchase online. Otherwise, a purchase outcome is less probable.

The methodology of global IT research (Loch & Straub, 2004) suggests that, following a specific model testing on one culture (e.g. U.S. culture), a submodel consisting of the original model's most salient factors is tested on two or three cultures to explore the differences. When choosing which factors to include in the submodel, one has to take into account how important these factors are for the second culture under consideration. Considering the specificity of Italian culture, as derived from the Hofstede and Fukuyama theories, the constructs we chose to test in this cross-cultural study were trust, privacy concerns, and perceived risk. Furthermore, as will be shown below, in Italian culture its rigorous measurement is crucial. For this reason, we included propensity to trust as an important antecedent to trust in this study.

Trust

In many recent MIS studies, trust was shown to be a crucial predictor of Internet use because the Internet environment is characterized by uncertainty and risk (Jarvenpaa *et al.*, 2000; Lee & Turban, 2001; Tan & Thoen, 2000; McKnight *et al.*, 2002; Gefen & Straub, 2003).

Following Lee & Turban (2001) and Van der Heijden *et al.* (2003), we consider the following dimensions of Internet trust: trustworthiness in the Internet site (i.e. ability, integrity, benevolence), trustworthiness in the Internet medium (i.e. technical competence, reliability), and individual propensity to trust (i.e. the extent to which one is inclined to believe people in general, including trusting strangers). The first two categories are dimensions of institutional trust (Figure 1) whereas the third is personal trust which is an antecedent to institutional trust (Lee & Turban, 2001; McKnight *et al.*, 2002).

The cognitive and affective dimensions of trust McAllister 1995 and one's propensity to trust in most cultures are influenced by the culture's collectivist and individualist orientations. Higher levels of trust are evident in social exchanges among group members in collectivist cultures (Hui *et al.*, 1991; Parks & Vu, 1994). In these cultures, one is unlikely to be trusting and cooperative with individuals outside of the group. Group membership influences whether a person is trusted. On the other hand, the propensity to trust people in general, including strangers who are not from one's social group, has been shown to be greater among individuals in societies characterized by higher individualist orientations (Yamagishi & Yamagishi, 1994; Inglehart *et al.*, 1998).

For Italy, however, the Hofstede index of individualism (IND) is not enough to explain the low level of trust present in this society. Indeed, a number of other countries have lower IND indices (i.e. are more collectivist than Italy), and yet have evolved to high-trust societies. For example, Japan, Germany and Austria (IND = 46, 67, and 55, respectively) are relatively more collectivist than Italy but in the Fukuyama theory of trust, all are rated as 'high-trust' societies. Fukuyama points to the specific historical, anthropological, and economical features of Italy's evolution to modernity which led to the development of what he calls 'pervasive' distrust (Bagnasco, 1988; Fukuyama, 1995) to the outsider in the Italian society. Banfield (1958) called the family-based isolation and the reliance on families as the sole source of trust and support 'amoral familism' and it is still more powerful than in any other European country (Bagnasco, 1988; Fukuyama, 1995). Numerous Italian historians and sociologists note the occurring government corruption, clientelism, and instability (Della Porta, 1992, 1994; Turone, 1992; Barca & Trento, 1994; D'Alberti & Finocchi, 1994; Mingione, 1994; Sapelli, 1994; Silj, 1994; Magatti, 1996; Bettini, 1998; Melis, 1999). All of them point out that this created a culture of general institutional distrust (see also Heidenheimer, 1996; Bull, 2001; Dickie, 2001). Furthermore, numerous sources and literature indicate, that all individuals in Italy have a lower propensity to trust than individuals in U.S. (Inglehart et al., 1998). Since the propensity to trust is an antecedent to institutional trust (Lee & Turban, 2001; McKnight et al., 2002; Van der Heijden et al., 2003), the lower propensity to trust will additionally affect institutional trust. Therefore:

H1: Individuals in Italy will have lower institutional trust towards Internet businesses than individuals in the U.S. in both cognitive and emotional factors.

The unique and extensive lack of trust in the Italian society calls for unique and extensive presence of trust-building practices and rituals that serve to facilitate communications and relationships among individuals and groups. Thus, several factors have evolved and shaped the trust-building process among Italians, namely, the higher context nature of the Italian culture, the importance of making a 'good personal impression' (la bella figura), and the need for face-to-face negotiations (Barzini, 1964). Partially as a result of the society's high UAI, these characteristics are evident in the political and artistic roots of Italy. Although Italians exhibit relatively higher UAI and collectivism as measured by Hofstede, they also have high insecurity acceptance (Gannon, 2004). Italians accept insecurity as part of life and events as they happen. This can also be seen in their reaction to the recently changing workplace with the old stability and certainty vanishing in favor of a higher propensity to change and risk (Bellotto, 1997). As a result, Italy exudes an aura of precariousness (Haycraft, 1985).

Thus, precariousness, coupled with low trust, reinforces the need for high context interpersonal communication which will serve to soften this aura. While individuals in the U.S., influenced by a fatherly cultural code of Anglo-Saxon relationships, tend to ignore the overture and get down to business quickly, Italians, whose social behavior is dominated by the motherly cultural code, emphasize communication, the need for a pleasant and colorful manner of personal introduction, interpersonal relations, and a positive relational climate (Bellotto & Trentini, 1989; Bellotto & Colautti, 1997). For example, recent psychological studies on the persuasion of advertisement (Mannetti, 2002; Russo, 2004a, b; Siri, 2004) show that negative and fearful messages have little success in Italy because of the motherly, protective, and group-oriented relationships as opposed to the individualist and pragmatic Anglo-Saxon and U.S. American relationships. Thus, in Italy a reassuring and protective message, typical of a relatively collectivist culture, is more effective than a violent and highly emotional one.

This pattern of behavior is typical in stores where Italians have a much higher tendency than Americans to interact with salespeople. In this sense, making a purchase the Italian way involves expressions of emotions, arguments, and persuasion. Even different voice tones may facilitate the final outcome of the sales (Gannon, 2004). These overtures reflect efforts to facilitate acceptance among individuals. They further facilitate building institutional trust among consumers and reducing the perceived risk that might be associated with completing business transactions. Therefore, trust, in the mind of the Italians, needs to be personalized as much as possible for a positive sales outcome and negotiation. The lack of personal communication in an e-commerce

context will translate to a weaker relationship between trust in Internet businesses and a successful e-commerce transaction.

The importance of *fare bella figura* – the projection of a confident, capable, knowing person who makes a good impression (Brint, 1989) - cannot be overstated and explains why, even when negotiating the smallest deal, Italians prefer face-to-face communications (Gannon, 2004). The positive outcome of a negotiation and a transaction depend on the polish and elegance of a presentation because people and things tend to be judged primarily by their appearances (Barzini, 1964; Gannon, 2004). In the context of this cultural phenomenon, one can see the difficulty of an impersonal Internet medium for making purchases when competing with the colorful, dramatic, ritual-filled interpersonal communication even if high institutional trust is present. Italians try to avoid risk and uncertainty, preferring friends over strangers, familiar over new situations. Thus, lacking the personal, face-to-face communication when using the Internet, and having a higher UA. coupled with higher than U.S. collectivism, a higher institutional trust may not translate to higher e-commerce use. Therefore:

H2: The relationship between institutional trust and e-commerce use will be weaker for individuals in Italy than in the U.S.

Internet privacy concerns and perceived risk

Privacy as a psychological construct and sociological issue has been researched by a wide range of scholars in diverse fields (Laufer & Wolfe, 1977; Margulis, 1977). All scholars (e.g., Margulis, 2003) recognize its complexity and the existing dichotomy between the individual and others, and explore its multidimensional, elastic, context-specific, and dynamic nature (Westin, 1975; Laufer & Wolfe, 1977). Most of the extant MIS research involves employees' perceptions of privacy values and beliefs (e.g. Smith et al., 1996; Milberg et al., 2000). The explosive development of digital, Internet, and storage technologies has triggered MIS researchers' interest in privacy (Mason, 1986; Culnan, 1993; Clarke, 1998; Culnan & Armstrong, 1999). Privacy has been operationalized as privacy concerns (Smith et al., 1996; Culnan & Armstrong, 1999; Milberg et al., 2000) which measure the anticipation of a possible future loss of privacy.

The concept of privacy is related to the extent that individualism is sought after and reinforced in a culture (Etzioni, 1999). In the U.S., a highly individualistic society, legal precedent and public opinion highly value privacy as an expression and a safeguard of personal dignity (Laufer & Wolfe, 1977) and individual right (Westin, 1975; Etzioni, 1999).

The perception of space is associated with the notion of privacy (Laufer & Wolfe, 1977). What is private space and what is public space, as well as how much physical

distance between people is considered normal, are related to perceptions of privacy (Hall & Hall, 1990). The 'externalization' of Italians and their communication patterns in public, whether in public gatherings or waiting lines, allow for less personal physical space between individuals than for individuals in the U.S. The relatively higher collectivism and low-trust nature in Italy is expressed in very close, emotional family relationships (Fukuyama, 1995; Gannon, 2004). The family is considered the greatest resource and protection of all troubles. Family connections are extremely important in one's career success, company success, and job hiring (Brint, 1989). Family loyalty is automatically expected and geographical separations are generally not well accepted, even when they are due to job promotions, marriage, or studying abroad (McGoldrick, 1982). Therefore, the family structure diminishes personal space and privacy (Wilde-Menozzi, 2003). A broad public discussion has recently begun that addresses threats to citizen privacy in the age of digital technology but this is directed towards circles outside the immediate family and to large corporate businesses (Stella, 2004). Linguistically, the word 'privacy' is borrowed from English because of its non-existence in the Italian language.

A factor, not directly connected to Hofstede's individualism, but which contributes, through less privacy, to less individualism in Italian society is the Italian's relatively higher necessity of voice communications. 'Italians put great emotion into their language, speaking with passion, rhythm, and changing tonality' (Gannon, 2004, p. 291). Oral communication in Italy is of utmost importance and is punctuated by elaborate gestures. They analyze everything around them through conversation and talking and it is the favorite pastime for most Italians. Thus, privacy is easily compromised since the Italian love of conversation limits the chances of anything staying secret, including personal and business confidentiality. This phenomenon is known as externalization (Gannon, 2004).

In summary, U.S. individuals have a higher regard for privacy compared to individuals in Italy. Paradoxically, although Italy has a relatively more collectivist culture than the U.S. where individuals outside the group are less trusted, the cooperative element of the collectivist culture to reinforce mutual goals could be, in general, associated with a greater willingness to disclose personal information than in cultures that are more individualistic, such as the U.S. We conclude that although Italians are members of a low-trust society, they tend to surrender personal information more easily than individuals in the U.S. Once they trust the entity, they are comfortable with a lower state of privacy. Even though, in general, individuals in the U.S. tend to trust more easily, they are less comfortable with releasing personal information and would prefer to keep such information within 'their own space.'

H3: *Individuals in Italy will have lower privacy concerns than individuals in the U.S.*

H4: The relationship between privacy concerns and ecommerce use will be weaker for the individuals in Italy than in U.S.

Several research studies underscore perceived risk as an important factor inhibiting online transactions (Van der Heijden et al., 2003). Previous research has confirmed that perceived risk is an antecedent to privacy concerns (Dinev & Hart, 2004, 2006). Defined as a perceived potential risk that occurs when personal information is revealed, perceived risk is connected to the UAI of the culture. Higher uncertainty avoidance cultures would have higher sensitivity to possible risks, and thus, their perceived risk would be higher. Furthermore, the role of the perceived risk on privacy concerns and on trust would be more pronounced. Thus, we posit that the privacy concerns of a low-trust culture with high uncertainty avoidance index will be more strongly determined by the perceived risk than of an individualistic, high trust culture with a low uncertainty avoidance index:

- **H5:** *Individuals in Italy will have higher perceived risk than individuals in the U.S.*
- *H6:* The relationship between perceived risk and privacy concerns will be stronger for individuals in Italy than in the U.S.

Because the trust-building process for Italians requires, as argued above, face-to-face communication and making a good impression, a lower perceived risk will not necessarily yield higher institutional trust in the online business in Italy. Thus, we expect a weaker relationship between perceived risk and institutional trust. Similarly, lower perceived risk will not necessarily be as strongly connected to increased e-commerce use as in U.S. society. Lacking personal, face-to-face communication in an e-commerce transaction, when higher UAI is coupled with higher collectivism, even a lower perceived risk may not translate to higher e-commerce use in Italy. Therefore:

- **H7:** The relationship between perceived risk and institutional trust will be weaker for individuals in Italy than in the U.S.
- **H8:** The relationship between perceived risk and *e-commerce use will be weaker for individuals in Italy than in the U.S.*

Methodology and results

The hypotheses were empirically tested using data collected from a survey. The survey was administered to broad samples of individuals from Northern Italy and the Southeast U.S. who were asked to participate voluntarily. The demographic distribution of the 889 participants from Northern Italy and 422 participants from the southeast of U.S. (response rate 47%) are presented in

Privacy calculus model in e-commerce Tamara

 Table 2
 Demographic information of respondents

| Frequency | Gender (female) | Age | Internet experience (years) |
|------------------|--------------------|---|---|
| ltaly | 33.6% | <20 years - 23.2% 21-30 years - 63.9% 31-40 years - 9.4 % Other - 3.5% | <2 years – 14.8% 2–5 years – 57.7% >5 years – 27.5% |
| United States | 51.4% | < 20 years - 13% | <2 years - 9.1% |
| | | 31–40 years – 38.1% Other – 11.6% | >5 years – 47.6% |

Table 2. As seen from the demographics distribution, the sample is diverse, comprising a wide range of age, education, with approximately equal representation of genders at least in the U.S.

The Internet privacy and perceived risk instruments were taken from Dinev & Hart (2004, 2006), and the trust instrument was adapted from Gefen & Straub (2003), Jarvenpaa *et al.* (2000), and Lee & Turban (2001). As a behavioral item, Internet use, including e-commerce use, was adapted from Chau *et al.* (2002) and Pavlou & Fygenson (2005). The actual items were slightly modified from the original instruments to capture the context of this study.

The questionnaire was translated from English to Italian and then back to English following a generally accepted practice to ensure consistency in cross-lingual surveys (Karahanna *et al.*, 2002). It was pretested with multiple respondents from Italy and U.S. who varied in age, gender, and education. No major problems were identified, but an instrument refinement and a few modifications in the Italian translation followed.

Measure validation for reliability was established through examining Cronbach's alpha coefficient for each

construct, and discriminant and convergent validity was initially examined through exploratory principal component factor analysis with a Varimax rotation. The measurement of institutional trust encompassed the items for integrity, benevolence, technical competence and reliability, all loading into one factor. All items loaded on their hypothesized constructs, with low, below 0.20 cross-loadings. Confirmatory factor analysis with LISREL was then conducted to further validate the measures of the principal constructs. The high factor loadings (above 0.70), composite reliability, and the average variance extracted (AVE) for each construct all confirmed the reliability, convergent and discriminant validity of the instrument for both cultures (Table 3). Indeed, the square root of the AVE was much larger than all the other cross-correlations for both samples, and both AVE and the composite reliability were higher than the recommended lowest limit of 0.60. Table 3 also lists the mean values and standard deviations of each construct.

The moderating effect of culture on the constructs' mean values was analyzed through the paired-sample *t*-test on mean value differences of each construct (Table 3). As seen from Table 3, all constructs' mean differences between the two cultures exhibited statistical difference at level 0.01 and are in the hypothesized directions. Italians exhibited lower propensity to trust, as shown in numerous Italian studies, lower institutional trust, lower privacy concerns, and higher perceived risk, as stated in H1, H3, and H5, respectively.

In order to examine hypotheses H2, H4, H6, H7, and H8 of the study, a structural equation modeling (SEM) with LISREL 8.0 was employed (Figure 2) for each country. The model resulted in a converged, proper solution with a low χ^2 per degree of freedom and very good values of the fit indices for both countries (Table 4).

The path coefficients differences between the two SEM models (Figure 2) were statistically different, based on the *t*-test results, and were in the hypothesized direction. A more rigorous testing of the cultural effect is provided by the LISREL multigroup analysis through the χ^2 test. In

| | Italy | | | | United States | | | | | |
|---------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------|-------------|
| | EU | РС | IT | РТ | PR | EU | РС | IT | РТ | PR |
| EU | 0.66 [0.63] | | | | | 0.95 [0.93] | | | | |
| РС | - 0.20 (0.04) | 0.93 [0.86] | | | | - 0.42 (0.05) | 0.94 [0.76] | | | |
| IT | 0.19 (0.04) | -0.01 (0.04) | 0.77 [0.73] | | | 0.58 (0.05) | - 0.37 (0.05) | 0.76 [0.72] | | |
| РТ | 0.04 (0.04) | - 0.13 (0.04) | 0.14 (0.04) | 0.84 [0.81] | | 0.20 (0.06) | 0.11 (0.05) | 0.17 (0.05) | 0.79 [0.75] | |
| PR | - 0.09 (0.04) | 0.69 (0.02) | - 0.09 (0.04) | - 0.16 (0.04) | 0.82 [0.77] | -0.12 (0.06) | 0.39 (0.05) | - 0.32 (0.05) | 0.15 (0.06) | 0.76 [0.72] |
| Cronbach's α | 0.72 | 0.87 | 0.74 | 0.81 | 0.84 | 0.77 | 0.93 | 0.82 | 0.79 | 0.86 |
| Mean values | 1.59 | 3.53 | 2.82 | 2.87 | 3.41 | 3.30 | 3.86 | 3.03 | 3.38 | 3.04 |
| SD | 0.77 | 0.93 | 0.62 | 0.74 | 0.84 | 1.03 | 0.94 | 0.67 | 0.91 | 0.10 |

Table 3 Latent variable statistics

EU = e-commerce use, PC = privacy concerns, IT = institutional trust, PT = propensity to trust, PR = perceived risk. Correlations with error terms (in paratheses) are the off-diagonal terms, and the composite reliabilities and the square root of AVE (in square brackets)

are the diagonal terms. Significant coefficients and mean differences in means at P < 0.01 level are shown in bold and at level P < 0.05 in italics.



Figure 2 SEM completely standardized path coefficients, with error terms shown in parantheses. Top coefficients: Italy, bottom coefficients: United States. Bold denotes statistical significance at level 0.01, and * - at level 0.05.

this test, a model is analyzed in which the path coefficient between any two constructs of the model is constrained to have the value of one in the corresponding model for the other culture. This constrained model's $(\chi^2)'$ is then compared to the original model's χ^2 where the correlation between the same two constructs was estimated freely.

Since the difference in degrees of freedom between the two models is 1, a difference in χ^2 greater than 3.84 suggests that the two constructs are statistically significant at level 0.05. This will prove the cultural moderating effect. The results from the χ^2 tests on the relationships are shown on Table 5. Thus, the relationships between institutional trust and e-commerce use (H2), privacy concerns and e-commerce use (H4), and perceived risk and institutional trust (H7) are all weaker for Italy, while the relationship between perceived risk and privacy concerns (H6) is stronger for Italy. The model showed no differences between U.S. and Italy for the relationship between perceived risk and between perceived risk and e-commerce use (H8). Thus, H8 was not supported by the empirical results.

The results of this study indicate that all of the research hypotheses, with exception of H8 were supported. The Italian culture, in general, shows a lower propensity to trust, lower institutional trust, higher perceived risk and, for the etic and emic considerations described in the theoretical section, lower privacy concerns than the individualistic U.S. culture.

Implications of the study and future work

The findings of this study are in accordance with the theoretical model and the expectations related to the presented etic and emic cultural arguments. This study makes several contributions. First, it advances our under-

Table 5 χ^2 -test for culture moderating effect

| Construct relationship | $(\chi^2)'$ | $\Delta \chi^2$ | Significance |
|------------------------|-------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| EU-PC | 344.85 | 13.11 | 0.01 |
| EU-IT | 479.47 | 147.73 | 0.01 |
| EU-PR | 332.79 | 1.05 | Not significant |
| PR-PC | 452.53 | 120.79 | 0.01 |
| PR-IT | 405.77 | 74.03 | 0.01 |
| PT-IT | 331.82 | 0.08 | Not significant |
| | | | |

 $\Delta \chi^2 = (\chi^2)' - \chi^2.$

standing of e-commerce behavior by validating the results from the Dinev & Hart's (2006) study. The factors presented in our study which influence e-commerce use, comprise a set of beliefs in a 'calculus'-like decision process in which contrary beliefs are weighed and where the strength of one may over-ride the influence of another. The relative strength of the inhibitors and the drivers provides insight into a complex process that leads to decisions to transact over the Internet. A high level of e-commerce use must be preceded by higher levels of trust than the levels of perceived risk and privacy concerns. Higher levels of negative beliefs would suggest user resistance to purchase online. The fact that our model includes contrary antecedents indicates that their relative influence needs to be taken into full consideration when attempting to understand planned behavior and supports a privacy calculus framework. While Dinev & Hart's (2006) model explored the behavioral intention to disclose personal information to conduct online purchases

Theoretical models based on the notion of a calculus can advance our understanding of the antecedents of behavioral intention by encouraging the examination of potentially contrary factors. While a number of prior studies have found that trust is an important antecedent to the intention to transact online (e.g., Jarvenpaa et al., 1999, 2000; Gefen, 2000; Gefen et al., 2003; Van Der Heijden et al., 2003; Pavlou and Gefen, 2004), the contribution of our study is that trust was included and found to be an important factor in a larger and more complex model incorporating also inhibiting beliefs like privacy concerns and perceived risk. The strength of the relationship between trust and e-commerce use supports the notion that trust is more necessary for countering the risk related to privacy uncertainty than perceived risk related to economic uncertainty that is often implied in other e-commerce investigations.

 Table 4
 Model assessment indices for both cultures. LISREL notation applied

| Goodness of fit measures | χ^2 (d.f.) | $\chi^2/d.f$ | NFI | CFI | IFI | NNFI | GFI | AGFI | RMR | RMSEA |
|--------------------------|-----------------|--------------|------|------|------|------|------|------|-------|-------|
| Italy | 331.74 (97) | 3.42 | 0.94 | 0.96 | 0.96 | 0.95 | 0.95 | 0.93 | 0.044 | 0.055 |
| U.S. | 210.27 (97) | 2.17 | 0.95 | 0.97 | 0.97 | 0.96 | 0.93 | 0.91 | 0.062 | 0.055 |

While successful models of e-commerce use showing the importance of privacy concerns and trust beliefs have been developed, all of them were U.S. centered and used only the U.S. as the cultural base. The contribution of this study is that it is among the few attempts to validate an e-commerce model across two cultures in the IS literature. Validating models of Information Technology and e-commerce use across cultures is of utmost importance for a globalized economy and further development and expansion of information systems and their use. All the relationships were proven statistically significant for both U.S. and Italian cultures, thus showing the validity of the model beyond U.S. society.

Another major implication of the study is that, by applying two of the most influential cultural theoretical frameworks, those of Hofstede and Fukuyama, the study integrates the cultural effect of two Western but culturally distinguishable nations into a model of e-commerce use. It shows that, in the world of growing importance and presence of e-commerce, culture significantly moderates key antecedents and relationships. A major study by Zhu et al. (2003) involving 3100 businesses in eight European countries investigated the adoption of electronic business at the firm level. While this is one of the first cross-country IT studies, it limited itself to observing interesting cross-country differences without offering theoretical cultural explanations. Thus, with its theoretically rich cultural considerations, our study is a key contribution to the now emerging more comprehensive and deeper cross-cultural analysis of IT use in general and e-commerce and Internet use in particular (Pavlou & Chai, 2002).

This study confirms the previous findings on the role of trust, and it sheds light on its cultural dimensions. The importance of trust, especially in the low-trust Italian society and the highly individualist U.S. society cannot be understated. We show that both etic and emic aspects enhance the role of trust. Both collectivism and uncertainty avoidance indices can significantly contribute to cultural differences in both propensity to trust and institutional trust and explain the research hypotheses. In the cultural context of Italy, the e-commerce research model including trust is of utmost importance, and our findings are in line with Fukuyama's and Hofstede's concepts. The uncertainty avoidance index influences the perceived risk which, for Italian culture, is much higher than U.S. culture.

An important implication of this study is the reaffirmation of Fukuyama's argument about low-trust societies like Italy and its validation for e-commerce use. It is widely accepted that trust as a cultural resource acts as a lubricant that enhances the information flow, reduces transaction costs and makes economic exchanges more productive. Thus, trust fosters economic growth and facilitates innovative actions (Fukuyama, 1995; Zak & Knack, 2001; Volken, 2002). Fukuyama further argues that high-trust societies (e.g. U.S., Germany, Japan, and the U.K.) are associated with plentiful social capital and the ability to create large, modern, professionally managed business corporations. The economies of relatively low-trust societies (e.g. Taiwan, Hong Kong, France, and Italy) are traditionally populated by fragmented familyowned businesses (Fukuyama, 1995). Following Fukuyama, family values in certain societies can be too strong to permit formation of modern economic structures. Therefore, in the low-trust, familistic society of Italy, in order to enhance technology diffusion in general, and the Internet in e-commerce usage in particular, larger-scale businesses may need to be created or undertake the major portion of e-commerce business. This can happen, however, primarily through government 'initiatives, subsidizing, guidance, or even outright ownership' (Fukuyama, 1995, p. 30).

Our findings from H2 about the stronger need for faceto-face communication corroborate the results of recent Italian studies on development and use of on-line counseling by a large organization traditionally providing telephone counseling service for children (Russo & Colautti, 2004; Russo *et al.*, 2004). Counselors expressed strong opposition to the on-line version of their telephone system, lamenting the reduction of personal contact and the difficulty in creating a trusting relationship with the help seeker. The on-line relationship was not perceived as natural, functional and able to substitute for the face-to-face communication (Russo, 2003).

We consider our study a contribution which will advance the theoretical and intellectual understanding of cross-cultural phenomena and their influences on economical and psychological differences of Internet and e-commerce use. Different activities are impacted by culture in various ways. For example, occupational similarities neutralize cultural differences, as in the case of doctors working together, or managers overseeing high-incentive, cross-country, joint projects where teams may tend to minimize cultural differences if attractive rewards for the goal achievement are available (Gannon, 2004). Sociologists have discussed the importance of Information Technology as an important catalyst of societal change having the effect of converging the social values, management practices, and social institutions (Kerr, 1946; Harbison & Myers, 1959; Farmer & Richman, 1965). In this respect, Escobar (1995) and Werther (1996) see the Internet and similar technologies leading to a single, global information-based society with a more uniform culture. In contrast, Wallace (1999) argues that the Internet has not brought in a 'global village.' Instead, individuals with common interests find one another and cluster on the Internet. In this way, the Internet has led to even more differentiation (Gannon, 2004). Similarly, Huntington (1993) argues that culture is becoming dominant with respect to economics and ideology and is becoming the major source of conflicts. Hofstede (1980, 2003), Schneider & Barsoux (1997), and Fukuyama (1995) contend that cultures are highly resistant to change and that has a major influence in management practices and institutions. Thus, at this time the bidirectional influence between culture and IT is a source of two opposite social theories about societal changes. This confusion magnifies the need to understand the relationship of technology–culture and attempts to apply the findings to enhance the opportunities for globalization and cultural exchanges over the Internet and through e-commerce. Extending our study to implement longitudinal methodology, we could trace the effect of e-commerce on culture and how those relationships change with time. Knowing as much as possible about culture is critical in the globalized, interconnected world where people from different ethnic and cultural groups must work together effectively and form professional and personal relationships.

In addition to the etic framework, this research sheds light on the dimensions that require emic perspective. We progressively reflected on the emic perspective into the enforced general structure as suggested by Malhotra et al. (1996) and made our study more comprehensive than a mere comparison of the Hofstede and Fukuyama indicators. It has been recognized that cross-cultural studies in IS have innate problems, partly because they do not have the ability to operationalize 'culture' (Straub et al., 2002). Although dominating IS research, Hofstede's cultural theory is considered dichotomic and simplistic (Myers & Tan, 2002; Ford et al., 2003) and new, more multidimensional theories need to be adopted that avoid reliance on assumed espoused cultural values (Straub et al., 2002). Even though we used the common models for building our hypotheses, by presenting a more multidimensional and complex picture of cultural differences, we believe we went beyond these models of national character and moved closer to adopting a more dynamic view for studying the effects of the Internet and globalization on changing the perceptions of trust, privacy, and culture in general. Our reliance on Hofstede's cultural measures, which we used for hypotheses building was qualitative rather than quantitative. Recent changes in culture not captured by these measures bear less importance for our model.

There are several practical implications for managers considering e-commerce in Italy. First, the trust-building process should be taken in its full seriousness given that Italy is a low-trust society. Trust should be the key to facilitating the exchange of personal information in the Internet environment. Second, as Gannon (2004, p. 291) pointed out, 'the reliance on spectacle must be clearly grasped if one wants to understand the Italians. Spectacle helps people solve most of their problems and governs public and private life. It is one of the reasons why Italians have always excelled in activities in which impressions are important: architecture, decoration, landscape, opera, fashion, cinema.'

Thus, conveying a good impression on potential customers through proper design, functionality, use of style and taste in graphics and web design is of primary importance. Considerable management effort needs to be made in establishing a satisfactory online relationship before requesting detailed personal information. Expert advice, free gifts for returning customers, honest and comprehensive reviews, references and opinions through the chat room or bulletin board, customer service availability 24/7 can be some of the process-based mechanisms used to build a reputation for an excellent website and ensure a growing customer base. Receiving free advice and extra services may be equivalent to the crucial communication between store clerk and customer in face-to-face purchasing. Italians, being more grouporiented than U.S. citizens, might develop a sense of obligation to repay the shown generosity and goodwill, and thus become a returning customer due to their reciprocity norms. In contrast, in very individualistic societies such as in the U.S., concern about privacy can over-ride other factors that may influence online transactions. Since individualists are universalists, a special favor to a particular business is unlikely.

In addition to the common generalizability limitations due to demographic samples, several other limitations of this study should be mentioned that need to be addressed in future research. First, the constructs of trust, perceived risk, and privacy need to be incorporated into a more comprehensive model derived from the most influential social theories as applied to MIS, such as Theory of Planned Behavior or Technology Acceptance Model (Pavlou & Chai, 2002). The most salient constructs need to be selected so the parsimony of the model is not compromised while the predictive power is enhanced. Privacy and trust need to be considered in the nomological net of other important factors which contribute to the risk-benefit analysis of a potential e-commerce transaction. These include both inhibitors and facilitators, such as perceived control, self-efficacy, and general interest.

Second, the pronounced inhomogeneity of Italian culture needs to be taken into account and should inform of the generalizability limitations of the current study. Local subcultures such as the Venetian and the Piedmontese in the industrial North, and the Neapolitan and Calabrian in the South are characterized with substantial differences, including in trust and privacy attitudes. Finally, research should extend beyond e-commerce and include other aspects of Internet use, including use for social communications, hobby, and information seeking and acquisition. Preliminary findings, specifically for Italy, suggest that the Internet tends to be used more for social communication and hobby pursuits than for e-commerce. A greater understanding of cultural issues may inform prospective commercial website sponsors of how to better implement Internet technology to more successfully diffuse e-commerce in Italy.

Additionally, a deeper look into the demographic differences of Internet users of the two societies needs to be undertaken. One remarkable difference, for example, is the differences in Internet experience (Table 2). Given that about equal number of respondents were in the age groups of both societies, one can see that more

Internet users from U.S. have greater than 5 years of experience. This may lead us to the conclusion that the Italian Internet users started to use the Internet for e-commerce purposes relatively recently. This may also have a certain impact on the model in the sense that the e-commerce environment is relatively new for the Italians. Because the uncertainty avoidance index for the

About the authors

Tamara Dinev is Assistant Professor in the Department of Information Technology and Operations Management, Florida Atlantic University, Boca Raton, Florida. Her research spans information privacy, harmful technologies prevention, and cross-cultural research in information systems. She recently published in International Journal of E-commerce, Behavior and Information Technology, and Communications of the ACM.

Massimo Bellotto is Full Professor and Coordinator of the Ph.D. program in the Department of Psychology of Work and Organizational Psychology at the University of Verona, Verona, Italy. He published several academic books and articles in journals including International Journal of cross-cultural Management, Innovation, Psicologia del Trabajo Y de las Organizaciones Risorsa Uomo.

Paul Hart is Associate Professor and Chair of the Department of Information Technology and Operations Management, Florida Atlantic University, Boca Raton, Florida. His research spans computer networks in organizational boundaries, trust in online transactions, and information privacy. He has published in a number of journals including Organization Science, Journal of

References

- BAGNASCO A (1998) La costruzione sociale del mercato: studi sullo sviluppo della piccola impresa in Italia. Il Mulino, Bologna.
- BANFIELD EC (1958) The Moral Basis of a Backward Society. Free Press, Glencoe, IL.
- BARBA P (2000) Ora si che il Mercato è Senza Frontiere. *IL Mondo* 17 November, p. 6.
- BARBA P and FERRO L (2000) Nel rapporto con il pubblico, ma sopratutto tra aziende, il business via Internet rivoluziona le strategie distributive. *Il Mondo* 21 July.
- BARCA L and TRENTO S (1994) L'Economia della corruzione. Laterza, Roma.
- BARZINI L (1964) The Italians. Atheneum, New York.
- BELLMAN S, JOHNSON EJ, KOBRIN SJ and LOHSE GL (2004) International differences in information privacy concerns: a global survey of consumers. *The Information Society* **20**, 313–324.
- BELLOTTO M (Ed.) (1997) Valori e lavoro. Franco Angeli, Milano.
- BELLOTTO M and COLAUTTI C (1997) The psycho-social diagnosis of organizational culture. In *Feelings Work in Europe* (AVALLONE F, ARNOLD J and DE WITTE K, Eds), pp 87–96, Guerini e Associati, Milano.
- BELLOTTO M and TRENTINI G (1989) Culture organizzative e formazione. Franco Angeli, Milano.
- BERRY JW (1980) Introduction to methodology. In *Handbook of Cross Cultural Psychology* (TRIANDIS HC and BERRY JW, Eds), Vol. 2, pp 1–29, Allyn and Bacon, Boston, MA.
- BETTINI R (1998) Burocrazia tra diritto politica e corruzione. FrancoAngeli, Milano.

Italian society is higher, the relatively new e-commerce use may be characterized with higher perceived risk and lower institutional trust, and we may expect the first to become lower and the latter to increase in the future as e-commerce use becomes a more mature and tried activity. Again, a future longitudinal study is needed to see the effects of Internet experience on the model.

Management Information Systems, and International Journal of Electronic Commerce.

Vincenzo Russo is Assistant Professor of Work and Organizational Psychology and Consumer Psychology, University IULM, Milan, Italy. He is also Member of the Scientific Board of the Business School ISIDA, Palermo, Italy. His research and publications are related to the themes of the consumer behaviour, quality system for the telephone and online counselling.

Ilaria Serra teaches at the Department of Italian Studies at Florida Atlantic University, Boca Raton, Florida. Her research interests include Italian cinema and literature, history of Italian immigration to the United States, and Internet use in Italy. She published several articles and books both in Italy and the U.S.

Christian Colautti teaches work and organizational psychology and consumer psychology at University IULM, Milan, Italy. His research includes quality system for the telephone and online counselling. He presented his research in several Italian and International conferences.

- BOURDIEU P (1984) Distinction: a Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste. Harvard University Press, Cambridge.
- BOURDIEU P (1989) Social space and symbolic power. *Sociological Theory* **7(1)**, 14–25.
- BRINT S (1989) Italy observed. Society July-August, 71-76.
- BULL AC (2001) Social and political cultures in Italy from 1869 to present day. In *Modern Italian Culture: the Cambridge Companion to Modern Italian Culture* (BARANSKI Z and WEST R, Eds), pp 35–61, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge U.K.
- CHAU PYK, COLE M, MASSEY AP, MONTOYA-WEISS M and O'KEEFE R (2002) Cultural differences in the online behavior of consumers. *Communications of the ACM* **45(10)**, 138–143.
- CHOUDRIE J and LEE H (2004) Broadband development in South Korea: institutional and cultural factors. *European Journal of Information Systems* **13(2)**, 103–114.
- CHURCH AT and KATIGBAK MS (1988) The emic strategy in the identification and assessment of personality dimensions in a non-western culture. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology* **19**, 140.
- CLARKE RA (1998) Information technology and dataveillance. Communications of the ACM **31**, 498–512.
- CULNAN MJ (1993) 'How did they get my name?': an exploratory investigation of consumer attitudes toward secondary information use. *MIS Quarterly* **17(3)**, 341–363.
- CULNAN MJ and ARMSTRONG PK (1999) Information privacy concerns, procedural fairness, and impersonal trust: an empirical investigation. *Organizational Science* **10(1)**, 104–115.

- CULNAN MJ and BIES RJ (2003) Consumer privacy: balancing economic and justice considerations. Journal of Social Issues 59(2), 323-342.
- D'ALBERTI M and FINOCCHI R (1994) Corruzione e sistema istituzionale. Il Mulino, Bologna.
- DELLA PORTA D (1992) Lo scambio occulto: casi di corruzione politica in Italia. Il Mulino, Bologna.
- DELLA PORTA D (1994) Corruzione politica e amministrazione pubblica: risorse, meccanismi, attori. Il Mulino, Bologna.
- DICKIE J (2001) The notion of Italy. In Modern Italian Culture: the Cambridge Companion to Modern Italian Culture (BARANSKI Z and WEST R, Eds), pp 17-33, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge U.K.
- DINEV T and HART P (2003) Privacy concerns and Internet use a model of trade-off factors. In Best Paper Proceedings of Annual Academy of Management Meeting, Seattle.
- DINEV T and HART P (2004) Internet privacy concerns and their antecedents - measurement validity and a regression model. Behaviour & Information Technology 23, 413-422.
- DINEV T and HART P (2006) An extended privacy calculus model of e-commerce transactions. Information Systems Research, forthcoming.
- ERBSCHLOE M (2001) Ten trends that will impact the Internet over the next five years. Information Systems Management 18, 25-29
- ESCOBAR A (1995) Anthropology and the future: new technologies and the reinvention of culture. Futures 27, 409-421.
- ETZIONI A (1999) The Limits of Privacy. Basic Books, New York.
- FARMER RN and RICHMAN BM (1965) Comparative Management and Economic Progress. Irwin, Homewood, IL.
- FORD DP, CONNELLY CE and MEISTER DB (2003) Information systems research and Hofstede's culture's consequences: an uneasy and incomplete partnership. IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management **50**, 8–25
- FUKUYAMA F (1995) Trust: the Social Virtues and the Creation of Prosperity. Free Press, New York,
- GANNON MJ (2004) Understanding Global Cultures: Metaphorical Journeys through 23 Countries, (2nd edn). Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, CA
- GEFEN D (2000) E-Commerce: the role of familiarity and trust. Omega: The International Journal of Management Science 28(6), 725–737.
- GEFEN D and STRAUB DW (2003) Managing user trust in B2C e-services. e-Service Journal 2(2), 7-24.
- GEFEN D, KARAHANNA E and STRAUB DW (2003) Trust and TAM in online shopping: an integrated model. MIS Quarterly 27(1), 51-90.
- HALL E and HALL E (1990) Understanding Cultural Differences. Intercultural Press, Yarmouth, ME.
- HARBISON F and MYERS CA (1959) Management in the Industrial World: an International Analysis. McGraw-Hill, New York.
- HAYCRAFT J (1985) The Italian Labyrinth. Penguin, New York.
- HEIDENHEIMER AJ (1996) The topography of corruption: explorations in a comparative perspective. International Social Science Journal 48(3), 337-347
- HILL CE, LOCH CK, STRAUB DW and EL-SHESHAI K (1998) A qualitative assessment of Arab culture and Information Technology transfer. Journal of Global Information Management 6, 29–38.
- HOFSTEDE G (1980) Culture's Consequences: International Differences in Work-Related Values. Sage, Beverly Hills, CA.
- HOFESTEDE G (2003) Culture's Consequences: Comparing Values, Behaviors, Institutions and Organizations across Nations. Sage, London.
- HUI CH, TRIANDIS HC and YEE C (1991) Cultural differences in reward allocation: is collectivism the explanation? British Journal of Social Psychology 30, 145-157.
- HUNTINGTON SP (1993) The clash of civilizations? Foreign Affairs 72(3), 22-49
- INGLEHART R, BASANEZ M and MORENO A (1998) Human Values and Beliefs: a Cross Cultural Sourcebook. University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor.
- JARVENPAA SL, TRACTINSKY N, SAARINEN L and VITALE M (1999) Consumer trust in an Internet store: a cross-cultural validation. Journal of Computer-Mediated Communications 5(2), 44–71.
- JARVENPAA SL, TRACTINSKY J and VITALE M (2000) Consumer trust in an Internet store. Information Technology and Management 1(1 and 2), 45-71
- KARAHANNA E, EVARISTO JR and SRITE M (2002) Methodological issues in MIS cross cultural research. Journal of Global Information Management 10, 13-23.

- KERR C (1946) The Future of Industrial Societies: Convergence or Continuing Diversity. Harvard Business School Press, Boston.
- LAUFER RS and WOLFE M (1977) Privacy as a concept and a social issue: a multidimensional developmental theory. Journal of Social Issues 33(3), 22-42.
- LEE M and TURBAN E (2001) A trust model for consumer Internet shopping. International Journal of Electronic Commerce 6(1), 75-91.
- LOCH K and STRAUB D (2004) A Retrospective Analysis of a Program of Research in Global IT, 12th Annual ICIS Cross-Cultural Meeting in Information Systems, Washington, DC.
- MAGATTI M (1996) Corruzione politica e societa' italiana. Il Mulino, Bologna
- MALHOTRA NK, AGARWAL J and PETERSON M (1996) Methodological issues in cross-cultural marketing research: a state of the art review. International Marketing Review 13(5), 7-43.
- MANDELLA A and BOSSI V (2002) World Internet Project Italy. SDA Bocconi, Milan. Available at http://www.worldinternetproject.net/ reports/wip2002-rel-15-luglio.pdf.
- MANNETTI L (2002) Psicologia Sociale. Carocci Editore, Roma.
- MARGULIS ST (1977) Conceptions of privacy: current status and next steps. Journal of Social Issues 33, 5.
- MARGULIS ST (2003) Privacy as a social issue and behavioral concept. Journal of Social Issues 59(2), 243.
- MASON RO (1986) Four ethical issues of the information age. MIS Quarterly 10(1), 4-12.
- MCALLISTER DJ (1995) Affect and cognition based trust as a foundation for interpersonal cooperation in organizations. Academy of Management Review 38(1), 24-59.
- MCGOLDRICK M (1982) Ethnicity and Family Therapy. Guilford, New York.
- MCKNIGHT DH, CHOUDHURY V and KACMAR C (2002) Developing and validating trust measures for e-commerce: an integrative typology. Information Systems Research 13(3), 334–359.
- MELIS G (1999) Etica pubblica e amministrazione: per una storia della corruzione nell'Italia contemporanea. CUEN, Napoli.
- MILBERG SJ, SMITH HJ and BURKE SJ (2000) Information privacy: corporate management and national regulation. Organization Science 11(1), 35-57.
- MINGIONE E (1994) Life strategies and social economies in the postfordist age. International Journal of Urban & Regional Research 18(1), 24-45.
- MYERS MD and TAN FB (2002) Beyond models of national culture in information systems research. Journal of Global Information Management 10(1), 24-32.
- NIELSEN (2004) Internet User Statistics and Population. Available at http:// www.nielsen-netratings.com.
- PARKS CD and VU AD (1994) Social dilemma behavior of individuals from highly individualist and collectivist cultures. Journal of Conflict Resolution 38(4), 708-718.
- PAVLOU PA and CHAI L (2002) What drives electronic commerce across cultures? A cross-cultural empirical investigation of the theory of planned behaviour. Journal of Electronic Commerce Research 3(4), 240-253.
- PAVLOU PA and GEFEN D (2004) Building effective online marketplaces with institution-based trust. Information Systems Research 15(1), 37-59.
- PAVLOU PA and FYGENSON M (2006) Understanding and predicting electronic commerce adoption: an extension of the theory of planned behavior. MIS Quarterly (forthcoming).
- RHEE E, ULEMAN JS and LEE HK (1996) Variations in collectivism and individualism by ingroup and culture: confirmatory factor analyses. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology 71, 1037.
- RUSSO V (2004a) Il ruolo attivo dell'individuo nella costruzione del significato e della realtà In Massimo Bellotto and Vincenzo Russo, Psicologia Sociale. McGraw-Hill, Milano.
- RUSSO V (2004b) Le dinamiche psicologiche nel consumatore. In Psicologia del Consumatore (SIRI G, Ed), pp. 101-121, McGraw-Hill, Milano
- RUSSO V (2003) La qualità della consulenza telefonica: principi di base e strumenti operativi in Ernesto Caffo (a cura di) Consulenza telefonica e relazione d'aiuto – La qualità dell'ascolto e dell'intervento con i bambini e gli adolescenti. McGraw-Hill, Milano.
- RUSSO V and COLAUTTI C (2004) Nouvelles compétences professionnelles et consultation téléphonique: analyse d'un cas de changement

Tamara Dinev et al

401

d'organisation. 13ème Congrès de psychologie du travail et des organisations Aiptlf, Bologna, 2004.

- RUSSO V, COLAUTTI C, BELLOTTO M and BUSTREO M (2004) News professional competencies for the on line counselling in the telephone help lines for children: a case of change organization in Italy. 28th International Congress of Psychology. Beijing, China.
- SAPELLI G (1994) Cleptocrazia: il 'meccanismo unico' della corruzione tra economia e politica. Feltrinelli, Milano.
- SILJ A (1994) Malpaese: criminalità, corruzione e politica nell'Italia della prima Repubblica, 1943–1994. Donzelli, Roma.
- SIRI G (2004) Psicologia del Consumatore. McGraw-Hill, Milano.
- SCHNEIDER SC and BARSOUX JL (1997) Managing Cultural Differences. Prentice-Hall, New York.
- SMITH HJ, MILBERG SJ and BURKE SJ (1996) Information privacy: measuring individuals' concerns about organizational practices. *MIS Quarterly* 20(2), 167–196.
- STELLA GA (2004) 'Tutti pedinati'. Garante e cittadini senza privacy. Corriere della Sera August 1, pp. 1.
- STRAUB DW, KEIL M and BRENNER W (1997) Testing the technology acceptance model across cultures: a three country study. *Information & Management* **33**, 1–11.
- STRAUB DW, LOCH CK, EVARISTO R, KARAHANNA E and STRITE M (2002) Toward a theory-based measurement of culture. *Journal of Global Information Management* **10**, 13–23.
- STRAUB DW, LOCH CK and HILL C (2001) Transfer of information technology to the Arab world: a test of cultural influence modeling. *Journal of Global Information Management* **9**, 6–28.
- TAN Y and THOEN W (2000) Toward a generic model of trust for electronic commerce. International Journal of Electronic Commerce 5(2),

61–74.

- TRIANDIS HC (1995) Individualism and Collectivism. Westview Press, Boulder, CO.
- TURONE S (1992) Politica ladra: storia della corruzione in Italia, 1861–1992. Laterza, Roma.
- UCLA (2000–2004) InternetReport: Surveying the Digital Future. Available at http://ccp.ucla.edu/pages/internet-report.asp.
- VAN DER HEIJDEN H, VERHAGEN T and CREEMERS M (2003) Understanding online purchase intentions: contributions from technology and trust perspectives. *European Journal of Information Systems* 12(1), 41–48.
- VOLKEN T (2002) Elements of trust: the cultural dimension of Internet diffusion revisited. *Electronic Journal of Sociology* 1, 1–20.
- WALLACE P (1999) The Psychology of Internet. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, U.K.
- WEBER M (1946) The protestant sects and the spirit of the capitalism. In *Essays in Sociology* (WRIGHT-MILLS C and GERTH H, Eds, and Trans.), p 310, Oxford University Press, New York.
- WERTHER WB (1996) Towards global convergence. Business Horizons 39(1), 3–9.
- WESTIN A (1975) Privacy and Freedom. Vintage, Ebury.
- WILDE-MENOZZI W (2003) Mother Tongue, An American Life in Italy. North Point Press: New York.
- YAMAGISHI T and YAMAGISHI M (1994) Trust and commitment in the United States and Japan. *Motivation and Emotion* **18**, 129–166.
- ZAK PJ and KNACK S (2001) Trust and growth. *The Economic Journal* **111**, 295–321.
- ZHU K, KRAEMER K and XU S (2003) Electronic business adoption by European firms: a cross-country assessment of the facilitators and inhibitors. *European Journal of Information Systems* **12(4)**, 251–268.

Appendix A: Study's instrument items. All items employ 5-point Likert scale

| Construct | Item | Question | Response range |
|---|------|---|------------------------------|
| E-commerce use (EU) | | How often do you use the Internet to do the following: | Never – All the time |
| Adapted from Chau et al. (2002) | EU1 | Buy something | |
| and Pavlou & Fygenson (2005). | EU2 | Sell something | |
| | EU3 | Conduct money transactions | |
| | | How much do you agree with the following: | Strongly disagree – Strongly |
| Privacy concerns (PC) | PC1 | I am concerned that the information I submit on the Internet could be misused. | agree |
| Adapted from Dinev & Hart (2004, 2006) | PC2 | I am concerned about submitting information on the Internet, because of what others might do with it. | |
| | PC3 | I am concerned about submitting information on the Internet, because it could be used in a way I did not | |
| | DC4 | Lam concorrect that my private information can show | |
| | rC4 | up on the Internet. | |
| Propensity to trust (PT) | PT1 | I am a trusting person | |
| Adapted from Lee & Turban | PT2 | I trust people in general | |
| (2001) and McKnight <i>et al</i> . (2002) | PT3 | I think most people can be trusted | |
| Institutional Trust (IT) | IT1 | I trust online businesses that they will not mishandle my personal information | |
| Adapted from Gefen & Straub (2003), Jarvenpaa <i>et al.</i> (2000), | IT2 | Internet websites are in general honest in conducting their business. | |
| and Lee & Turban (2001) | IT3 | Internet website providers handle personal information submitted by users in a competent fashion. | |
| | IT4 | Internet websites are safe and reliable places to exchange information with others. | |

| Appendix A Continued | | | | | |
|---------------------------|------|---|--------------------------------|--|--|
| Construct | Item | Question | Response range | | |
| Perceived risk (PR) | | How much risk do you believe is there if you use the Internet and give personal information (private or financial): | Very low risk – Very high risk | | |
| Adapted from Dinev & Hart | PR1 | Personal information submitted could be misused. | | | |
| (2004, 2006) | PR2 | Personal information could be made available to others without my knowledge. | | | |
| | PR3 | Personal information could be inappropriately used. | | | |